

09-10-2024
Leeuwarden,
The Netherlands

Dear Editor,

We would like to express our sincere thanks for your time and consideration of our manuscript (#2024:03:98788:1:1) titled: "*Calibrations without raw data – A response to 'Seasonal calibration of the end-cretaceous Chicxulub impact event.'*" With this letter we aim to address the addition of coauthor Jeroen van der Lubbe.

Jeroen has been involved with this work from the early stages, particularly in helping to analyse the methodological issues and stable isotope data presented in DePalma et al., 2021. We first raised these concerns with *Scientific Reports* in December 2021 and the list of problems encountered formed the foundation for this article (as well as the earlier version in the preprint)- as Robert DePalma addressed in this round of review, which we confirmed in our reply. However, during the ongoing investigations, Jeroen was advised against formal authorship at that time. By the time the investigations concluded, the article was already quite far in the review process, so we decided to proceed with the listed coauthors to avoid complications.

During review, Robert DePalma suggested that the reply article was not supported by the original coauthors. While the previous editor agreed that this is not how authorship works, reviewer 2 now specifically noted Jeroen van der Lubbe's absence. We would like to correct the misunderstanding that this article is not supported by the original authors of the During et al., 2022 paper, which should not be used as an argument against the credibility of this study. For many authors of the original study, their expertise was not relevant for this reply article, especially because of the lack of data. However, the suggestion of reviewer #2 to add Jeroen van der Lubbe was something we feel was valid, and therefore implemented. N.B. we would like to emphasize that he was invited on the paper from day one and he contributed to the paper since its inception. Our apologies for this last-minute addition, which we know is certainly not ideal, but not exceptional either.

As head of the stable isotope laboratory at the VU in Amsterdam, Jeroen was invaluable in evaluating the potential methodological approaches that could have led to the graphs in DePalma et al., 2021. With his expertise in various mass spectrometer setups and protocols, he promptly identified the insufficient methodological details, such as the omission of the laboratory where the analyses were conducted and the standards used. Jeroen contributed significantly to the analysis of the stable isotope and fish-size graphs, and his involvement has always warranted authorship on our paper.

We apologize for this late addition and appreciate your understanding. Please do not hesitate to contact us should you require further clarification. We look forward to your final decision.

On behalf of all authors,

Your sincerely,

Melanie During

